



«АККРЕДИТТЕУ ЖӘНЕ РЕЙТИНГТИҢ  
ТӘУЕЛСІЗ АГЕНТТІГІ» КЕМ

НУ «НЕЗАВИСИМОЕ АГЕНТСТВО  
АККРЕДИТАЦИИ И РЕЙТИНГА»

INDEPENDENT AGENCY FOR  
ACCREDITATION AND RATING



WORLD FEDERATION FOR  
MEDICAL EDUCATION

## STANDARDS

OF PROGRAM ACCREDITATION  
OF EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMS  
OF MASTER'S DEGREE



Astana 2016



Independent agency for  
accreditation and rating

**STANDARDS  
OF PROGRAM ACCREDITATION  
OF EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMS  
OF MASTER'S DEGREE**

**Astana city, 2016**

## Foreword

**1. DEVELOPED AND INTRODUCED** by the Non-Profit Institution "Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating."

**2. APPROVED AND PUT INTO EFFECT** by the order of the Director of the Non-Profit Institution "Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating" as of October 17, 2016 no. 39-16-1-OD.

**3.** This standard implements the norms of the Law of the Kyrgyz Republic "On Education" as of April 30, 2003 No. 92.

**4. INITIALLY INTRODUCED**

This standard cannot be fully or partially reproduced, replicated and distributed without permission of the non-profit institution "Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating".

## CONTENT

<b>GENERAL PROVISIONS .....</b>	<b>4</b>
<b>STANDARD “MISSION AND FINAL LEARNING OUTCOMES” .....</b>	<b>10</b>
<b>STANDARD “RESEARCH ENVIRONMENT AND EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES” .....</b>	<b>11</b>
<b>STANDARD “POLICY AND ADMISSION CRITERIA” .....</b>	<b>14</b>
<b>STANDARD “MASTER’S DEGREE PROGRAM” .....</b>	<b>14</b>
<b>STANDARD “SCIENTIFIC GUIDANCE” .....</b>	<b>16</b>
<b>STANDARD “THESIS” .....</b>	<b>16</b>
<b>STANDARD “THESIS EVALUATION” .....</b>	<b>17</b>
<b>STANDARD “MANAGEMENT AND ADMINISTRATION” .....</b>	<b>18</b>
<b>BIBLIOGRAPHY .....</b>	<b>21</b>

# STANDARDS OF PROGRAM ACCREDITATION

## General provisions

### 1.1. Applicable scope

1.1.1 This standard defines the regulatory requirements to the general provisions of the program accreditation standards of educational programs of the master's degree of medical organizations.

1.1.2 This standard is applied when conducting the accreditation procedure of the listed above educational programs of master's degree of medical educational organizations, regardless of their status, organizational and legal form, forms of ownership and departmental subordination.

1.1.3 This standard can also be used:

- a) by medical educational organizations for internal self-assessment and external evaluation of the educational program;
- б) for the development of relevant regulatory documentation.

### 1.2 Regulatory references

1.2.1 This standard contains references to the following regulatory documents:

1. The Law of the Kyrgyz Republic "On Education" as of April 30, 2003, No. 92 (as amended on January 16, 2015 No. 15).

2. The concept of development of education in the Kyrgyz Republic until 2020, approved by decree of the Government of the Kyrgyz Republic as of March 23, 2012 No. 201.

3. The strategy for the development of education in the Kyrgyz Republic for 2012–2020, approved by decree of the Government of the Kyrgyz Republic as of March 23, 2012 No. 201.

4. Resolution of the Government of the Kyrgyz Republic as of September 29, 2015 No. 670 "On approval of acts on independent accreditation in the education system of the Kyrgyz Republic".

5. Decree of the Government of the Kyrgyz Republic as of July 31, 2007 No. 303 "On Postgraduate Medical Education in the Kyrgyz Republic".

6. "Development Strategy for Postgraduate and Continuing Medical Education in the Kyrgyz Republic for 2014–2020" Order of the Ministry of Health of the Kyrgyz Republic No. 248 of 18.05.15.

### 1.3 Terms and definitions

In this standard terms and definitions are used in accordance with the Law of the Kyrgyz Republic "On Education":

1.3.1 Master's degree - a professional study program of postgraduate education, aimed at training scientific, scientific-pedagogical and managerial personnel with the award of an academic degree "Master" in the relevant specialty.

1.3.2 Scientific and pedagogical master's degree - the implementation of vocational curricula for postgraduate education for the preparation of scientific and pedagogical personnel for the system of higher, postgraduate education and scientific sphere with in-depth scientific and pedagogical training.

1.3.3 Master's degree student - a person obtaining master's degree.

1.3.4 Master's thesis - the final work of a master's degree student, which is a synthesis of the results of independent scientific research of one of the urgent problems of a particular specialty of the relevant branch of science.

1.3.5 Master - an academic degree awarded to persons who have mastered the educational programs of the master's degree and have publicly submitted a master's degree thesis.

1.3.6 Accreditation - a procedure by an accreditation agency to evaluate the quality level of an educational organization as a whole or its individual educational programs, during which it is recognized that the educational organization or educational program meets certain criteria and standards;

1.3.7 Accreditation bodies - legal entities that develop standards (regulations) and conduct accreditation of educational organization on the basis of the standards (regulations) developed by them;

1.3.8 Institutional accreditation - a procedure for the recognition by an accreditation agency of compliance with the level of quality of an educational organization as a whole to certain criteria, standards and its status;

1.3.9 International accreditation - accreditation of an educational organization or individual educational professional programs in a recognized foreign accreditation agency;

1.3.10 National accreditation - institutional accreditation of educational organizations or educational programs by national accreditation agencies;

1.3.11 Program accreditation - a procedure of assessment of the compliance of individual programs of an educational organization with certain criteria and standards;

1.3.12 Standards (regulations) of accreditation - documents of an accreditation body that establish the requirements for accreditation procedure.

1.3.13 Dublin descriptors - a description of the level and amount of knowledge, skills, abilities and competencies acquired by students upon completion of the educational program at each level (stage) of higher and postgraduate education, based on the learning outcomes, formed competencies, and the total number of ECTS credit units.

## **1.4 Designations and abbreviations**

In this standard, abbreviations are used in accordance with the regulatory documents specified in item 1.2.

In addition, the following designations and abbreviations are used in this standard:

HEI - higher education institution;

MH KR – Ministry of Health of the Kyrgyz Republic;

MES KR – Ministry of Education and Science of the Kyrgyz Republic;

KR – Kyrgyz Republic;

CPD - continuous professional development;

CME - continuous medical education;

TS – teaching staff;

MM – mass media;

SWOT-analysis - analysis of strengths and weaknesses, problems and opportunities of the organization, abbreviation of English words: S (strengths) - strengths, W (weaknesses) - weaknesses, O (opportunities) - favorable opportunities, T (threats) -

threats.

## **1.5 General provisions**

1.5.1 Program accreditation of master's degree programs is carried out according to these standards, which include: standard "Mission and final learning outcomes", standard "Research environment and educational resources", standard "Policy and admission criteria", standard "Master's degree program", standard "Scientific guidance", standard "Thesis", standard "Thesis evaluation", standard "Management and administration".

1.5.2 Standards of program accreditation of master's degree programs are developed on the basis of the International Standards of the World Federation for Medical Education (WFME), the Association of Medical Schools in Europe (AMSE) and the European model of accreditation of educational programs in the field of biomedicine and health sciences (ORPHEUS), with the introduction of national features of the healthcare system and medical education of the Kyrgyz Republic.

1.5.3 There are the following forms of accreditation:

1) by structure

1.5.3.1 institutional accreditation;

1.5.3.2 program accreditation;

2) by territorial recognition

1.5.3.3 national accreditation;

1.5.3.4 international accreditation.

1.5.4 The decision on accreditation is made by the Accreditation Council.

1.5.5 The Accreditation Council consists of representatives from MES KR, MH KR, medical educational organizations, scientific organizations, healthcare organizations, professional associations, employers, public representatives, master's degree students and international experts.

## **1.6 The main objectives of implementing the standards of program accreditation**

1.6.1 The main objectives of the implementation of standards of program accreditation are:

1.6.1.1 introduction of the accreditation model, harmonized with international practice of quality assurance of education;

1.6.1.2 assessment of the quality of vocational and educational programs to improve the competitiveness of national higher education system;

1.6.1.3 encouragement of the development of quality of culture in higher education institutions;

1.6.1.4 promotion of development and continuous improvement of the quality of educational programs of medical educational organizations in accordance with the requirements of a rapidly changing external environment;

1.6.1.5 accounting and protection of the interests of society and the rights of consumers by providing reliable information about the quality of educational programs;

1.6.1.6 use of innovations and research;

1.6.1.7 public announcement and distribution of information on the results of the accreditation of master's degree program of medical educational organizations.

## **1.7 Principles for the formation of standards for program accreditation**

1.7.1 The presented standards for ensuring the quality of educational programs of higher professional education are based on the following principles:

1.7.1.1 voluntariness - the procedure for the accreditation of educational programs is carried out on a voluntary basis;

1.7.1.2 honesty and transparency - internal and external evaluation is conducted in an extremely honest and transparent manner, ensuring the availability of information for all participants in the ongoing accreditation process;

1.7.1.3 objectivity and independence - internal and external evaluation is carried out objectively, regardless of third parties (state bodies, university administration and public opinion) and the obtained results;

1.7.1.4 responsibility of medical educational organizations - primary responsibility for the quality of higher education rests with medical educational organizations;

1.7.1.5 confidentiality - the information provided by higher education institutions is used by the accreditation body in confidence;

1.7.2 The external evaluation is conducted independently from third parties (state bodies, medical educational organizations and public organizations).

1.7.3 Information awareness of the country public and abroad about accredited educational programs is carried out in the mass media, incl. the presentation of the information on the website of the accreditation body.

## **1.8 Stages and procedures for the implementation of program accreditation**

1.8.1 The accreditation procedure includes the following steps:

1.8.1.1 application of a medical educational organization to the accreditation body;

1.8.1.2 a medical educational organization presents a brief description of its activities to the accreditation body;

1.8.1.3 signing of a bilateral contract between the accreditation body and the medical educational organization on accreditation, indicating the cost of the procedure and deadlines;

1.8.1.4 self-assessment procedure of the educational program conducted by the medical educational organization, which ends with the preparation of a report on the self-assessment of the educational program and on meeting the requirements of the standards and criteria defined by this standard;

1.8.1.5 submission of a report on self-assessment of the educational program of the medical educational organization to the accreditation body;

1.8.1.6 consideration of the report on self-assessment of the medical educational organization in the accreditation body;

1.8.1.7 external evaluation procedure - a visit to the university by an expert commission that conducts an external review and assessment, and prepares a report and recommendations for the Accreditation Council;

1.8.1.8 preparation of materials for accreditation of the educational program of the medical educational organization by the Accreditation Council;

1.8.1.9 consideration of the accreditation of the educational program of the medical educational organization by the Accreditation Council;

1.8.1.10 final decision by the Accreditation Council based on the recommendations



of the accreditation body;

1.8.1.11 publication of a brief report on the accreditation of the educational program of the medical educational organization on the website of the accreditation body in the event of a positive decision;

1.8.1.12 follow-up procedures to verify the elimination of comments made by the medical educational organization in the light of all the recommendations contained in the report of the external expert commission.

1.8.2 The procedure for accreditation of universities is carried out in accordance with the legislation of the Kyrgyz Republic in the sphere of education and science, including the SES of the Kyrgyz Republic at the expense of the financial resources of medical educational organizations at the request of the organization.

1.8.3 During the period when a medical educational organization conducts self-assessment of its educational program, the accreditation body provides the educational organization with consulting service, upon prior agreement.

1.8.4 After completion of the self-evaluation procedure of its educational program, the accredited medical educational organization (not less than 2 months before the intended visit of the expert commission) sends to the accreditation body 4 copies of a self-evaluation report of the educational program (in Russian and English), which is carefully studied by all members of the expert group before visiting this medical educational organization. After that, the expert commission visits the medical educational organization to assess the reliability of the self-assessment findings.

1.8.5 A visit to a medical educational organization is conducted within 2-3 days by a group of experts recommended by universities, research organizations, public associations and employers nominated and certified by the accreditation body. The regulation of the work of the expert group in the medical educational organization is carried out in accordance with the standard and guidelines on external evaluation when visiting a medical educational organization approved by the accreditation body.

1.8.6 Writing a report on a visit to a medical educational organization is carried out by external experts to the accreditation body (at least 5 days) and the results of the report are sent by the accreditation body to the medical educational organization.

1.8.7 Decision-making by the Accreditation Council is carried out on the basis of a self-assessment report of the educational program, the final report of the external expert commission, recommendations of the accreditation body based on the analysis of the documents presented above.

The report of the expert commission and the recommendations of the accreditation body are an obligatory condition for decision-making by the Accreditation Council.

1.8.8 The Accreditation Council makes the following decision:

1.8.8.1 to accredit for 1 year - with complying with the criteria in general, but with some drawbacks and opportunities for improvement;

1.8.8.2 to accredit for 3 years - with positive results in general, but with some minor drawbacks and opportunities for improvement;

1.8.8.3 to accredit for 5 years - with positive results in general;

1.8.8.4 denial of accreditation.

1.8.9 After making a positive decision on accreditation, the accreditation body gives a certificate of accreditation to the medical educational organization for a period of 1 year, 3 years or 5 years.

1.8.10 Further, the decision on accreditation of the educational program of the medical educational organization is sent to the MES KR and is posted on the website of the accreditation body.

1.8.11 In case of a negative decision, a educational organization has the right to appeal the decision of the Accreditation Council in accordance with the guidelines for self-assessment, as well as the legislation of the Kyrgyz Republic.

1.8.12. The accreditation body has the right to send a commission of experts to verify the elimination of comments noted by the external expert commission in the report when visiting a medical educational organization.

1.8.13 The medical educational organization shall be re-accredited after a set period of time to confirm the status of the accredited educational program and extend the term of accreditation.

### **1.9 Follow-up procedures**

1.9.1 In case of failure to comply with the requirements of the accreditation body in relation to the medical educational organization, the Accreditation Council has the right to make the following decisions:

- temporarily suspend the accreditation of the educational program,
- revoke the accreditation of the educational program of the educational organization, which may entail the cancellation of all previously achieved accreditation results and the obligation to go through all stages of accreditation again if the applicant expresses a wish to be accredited again.

1.9.2 In case of a positive decision by the Accreditation Council of IAAR, the educational organization develops a Plan for the implementation of the recommendations of the EEC. The plan is approved by the Director of IAAR and the director of the educational organization. The plan is the basis for post-accreditation monitoring.

1.9.3 Post-accreditation monitoring of the educational organization is carried out as follows:

Duration of accredited period	3 years	5 years
Interim report submission frequency	Once in 1.5 years	Twice every two years
Visit	Once	Twice

### **1.10 Procedure for introducing amendments and additions to accreditation standards**

1.10.1 Amendments and additions are made to the current accreditation standard in order to further improve it.

1.10.2 Amendments and additions to the standard are made by IAAR.

1.10.3 In the event of initiating amendments and additions to the current standard by

educational organizations and other interested bodies, proposals and comments are sent to IAAR.

1.10.4 IAAR conducts an examination of received proposals and comments on their validity and expediency in the prescribed manner.

1.10.5 Amendments and additions to the current accreditation standard after their confirmation are approval by the order of the Director of IAAR in a new edition with changes or in the form of a booklet-insert to the current standard.

## **2 Standard “MISSION AND FINAL LEARNING OUTCOMES”**

### **2.1 Mission statement**

2.1.1 Medical educational organization **shall** determine its mission and bring it to the attention of the stakeholders and the healthcare sector.

2.1.2 Medical educational organization **shall** ensure that the main stakeholders are involved in the development (formulation) of the mission.

2.1.3 The mission statement **shall** contain the objectives and educational strategy of the program, allowing to prepare a competent researcher at the postgraduate medical education level.

2.1.4 Medical educational organization **shall** ensure that the stated mission includes the problems of public health, the needs of the system of medical care and other aspects of social responsibility.

2.1.5 Medical educational organization **shall** have a strategic plan for the development of the educational program that complies with the stated mission, objectives of the medical educational organization, including the issues of improving the quality of master's degree programs and approved at the consultative and advisory council of the medical educational organization.

2.1.6 Medical educational organization **shall** systematically collect, accumulate and analyze the information about the quality of the implementation of master's degree programs; conduct an assessment of strengths and weaknesses (SWOT-analysis), on the basis of which the rectorate (pro-rectorate) together with the consultative and advisory council shall determine policy, develop strategic and tactical plans.

2.1.7 Mission and objectives of the medical educational organization/program:

- **shall** match the available resources, capabilities and labour market requirements;
- the ways to support them **shall** be defined;
- access to the information about the mission, objectives of the medical educational organization for the public (availability of information in the media, on the university website) **shall** be provided.

2.1.8 The mission and objectives of the medical educational organization/program **shall** be approved by the advisory council.

### **2.2 Institutional autonomy and academic freedom**

2.2.1 An organization implementing master's degree educational programs **shall** have institutional autonomy to develop and implement the policy for which the teaching staff and administration are responsible, especially in relation to:

- development of an educational program;

- use of allocated resources necessary for the implementation of the educational program.

Medical educational organization **should** guarantee academic freedom to its employees and master's degree students:

2.2.2 in relation to the existing educational program, which will be allowed to rely on different points in description and analysis of questions on medicine and pharmacy;

2.2.3 in ability to use the results of new research to improve the study of specific disciplines/issues without expanding the educational program.

### **2.3 Final learning outcomes**

2.3.1 Medical educational organization **shall** determine expected final learning outcomes that master's degree students shall show after completing the master's degree program.

2.3.2 Studying master's degree with the academic award of a master's degree **shall** ensure that master's degree students have the competence that will enable them to become a qualified teacher and/or researcher in accordance with the principles of the best research practice.

2.3.3 Completion of the master's degree program **shall** have potential benefits for those who continue their careers outside the medical organization, and apply their competencies gained during the master's degree program, including critical analysis, assessment and resolution of complex problems, ability to transfer new technologies and synthesis of new ideas.

2.3.4 Medical educational organizations **should** ensure that the process of updating and restructuring leads to the modification of final learning outcomes of master's degree students in accordance with the responsibilities that are assigned to graduates after graduating master's degree program.

## **3. Standard "RESEARCH ENVIRONMENT AND EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES"**

### **3.1 Research environment**

3.1.1 Success of individual master's degree programs **shall** be ensured by organizing a strong and efficient research environment.

The quality of research environment **shall** be evaluated by analyzing:

3.1.2 publication of research results (number of publications, impact factor, etc.) on the profile of master's degree in the medical educational organization;

3.1.3 the level of attracting external funding for research in a medical educational organization;

3.1.4 the number of qualified and competent teachers, researchers in the group, at the faculty, school;

3.1.5 national and international cooperation with research groups of medical organizations, universities, research centers.

3.1.6 Research **shall** be conducted in accordance with international ethical standards and approved by relevant and competent ethics committees.

3.1.7 In order to provide access to the means necessary for writing a thesis, master's degree programs **are able to** include training in other laboratories, preferably in another country, thereby ensuring internationalization.

3.1.8 The implementation of the master's program should take place in compliance with mutual respect, planning and the overall responsibility of a supervisor and master's degree student.

3.1.9 Medical educational organization **should** explore the possibility of providing joint master's degree programs with gaining degrees from both universities and joint management to support cooperation between higher education institutions.

3.1.10 Medical educational organization **should** ensure that the process of updating educational resources is carried out in accordance with changing needs, such as, for example, a set of master's degree students, the number and profile of academic staff, a master's degree program.

3.1.11 Medical educational organization **should**:

3.1.12 provide sufficient autonomy in the allocation of resources, including decent remuneration of teachers in order to achieve final learning outcomes;

3.1.3 in the allocation of resources, to take into account scientific achievements in medicine and problems of public health and their needs.

### **3.2 Material and technical base**

Medical educational organization **shall** have material and technical support that meets the licensing indicators, which include criteria:

3.2.1 classrooms, laboratories and their equipment **shall** be modern and adequate to the goals and objectives of a master's degree program;

3.2.2 master's degree students **shall** be provided with the conditions for independent study and research work;

3.2.3 updating and improvement of material and technical base **shall** be carried out regularly.

3.2.4 Medical educational organization **shall** have sufficient resources for the proper implementation of a master's degree program.

3.2.5 Organization resources **should** provide:

- admission of master's degree students,
- educational organization in master's degree program,
- thesis conduct,
- scientific guidance,
- Consultation of master's degree students,
- examination, review and evaluation of thesis,
- award of an academic master's degree,
- operating costs,
- costs of participation in training courses in international scientific conferences,
- tuition fees for master's degree programs in institutions where it is practiced,
- resources also include master's degree scholarship, however the amount of payment may vary.

3.2.6 Resource policy **should** be aimed at maintaining and ensuring the continuous professional growth of teachers of a master's degree program.

3.2.7 Medical educational organization **shall** provide a safe environment for employees, master's degree students and those who ensure the implementation of the program, including the provision of necessary information and protection from harmful substances, microorganisms, compliance with safety regulations in the laboratory and when using equipment.

3.2.8 Medical educational organization **should** improve learning environment of master's degree students through regular updating, expanding and strengthening the material and technical base, which should be consistent with the development in teaching practice.

### **3.3. Information technology**

3.3.1 Medical educational organization **shall** have information support appropriate to the goals and objectives of a master's degree program.

3.3.2 Library **shall** contain the necessary materials for study process - educational, technical, scientific and reference books, various medical periodicals, etc.

3.3.3 Master's degree students **shall** have timely and free access to library resources.

3.3.4 Library **shall** have basic technical equipment to support daily activities: fax machines, copy machines, computers, printers, available for public use, and a telephone with voice mail or answerphone.

3.3.5 Library **shall** have an informational website. The website may include the following elements: links, interlibrary exchange forms, full-text electronic journal articles, and a feedback form.

3.3.6 Medical educational organization **shall** regularly monitor library resources, study and implement strategies to meet current and future needs of master's degree students.

3.3.7 In the use of master's degree students **shall** be computer classes and terminals with access to information resources (local network, Internet).

3.3.8 Medical educational organization **shall** provide availability and adequate use of information resources for master's degree students.

3.3.9 Medical educational organization **shall** constantly update, improve and expand database of information resources.

3.3.10 Medical educational organization **shall** open and constantly update on its website a section on master's degree programs containing the following information:

- structure and staff of the master's degree department, duties of the head and staff of the department;
- admission policy, including clear rules on the selection process for master's degree students;
- list of master's degree programs;
- structure, duration and content of master's degree programs;
- criteria for the appointment of a supervisor, outlining the characteristics, duties and qualifications of a supervisor;
- methods used to evaluate master's degree students;
- criteria for the design and writing of thesis;
- description of the thesis submission procedure;

- description of the State Attestation Commission work on submission of master's theses;
- a quality assurance program and regular evaluation of a master's degree program;
- information on master's degree students taking into account the year of study.

#### **4. Standard "POLICY AND ADMISSION CRITERIA"**

4.1 Medical educational organization **shall** determine and implement a policy of admission, including a clearly defined position on the selection process of master's degree students.

4.2 Medical educational organization **shall** establish relations between the selection of master's degree students and the mission of the medical educational organization, educational program and expected quality of graduates.

4.3 Candidates for the master's degree program **shall** master professional curriculum of higher education (basic medical/pharmaceutical/chemical, higher professional or postgraduate education).

4.4 In selection of future master's degree students, applicant's research potential should be assessed, aside from his/her academic performance.

4.5 In medical educational organization there **shall** be a system of studying employment, demand, career support and continuous professional improvement of graduates.

4.6 Data, obtained using this system, **shall** be used to further improve educational programs.

4.7 Medical educational organization **should** ensure that the process of updating and restructuring leads to adaptation of a master's degree student admission policy to meet changing expectations and circumstances, human resource requirements, changes in the system of postgraduate education and the needs of the program.

#### **5. Standard "MASTER'S DEGREE PROGRAM"**

##### **5.1 Model of the educational program, teaching methods and structure**

5.1.1 Medical educational organization **shall** determine the model of the educational program, including an integrated model based on disciplines, organ systems, clinical problems and diseases, on modules or spiral design.

5.1.2 Medical educational organization **shall** determine the purpose and objectives of the master's degree program, which are aimed at achieving final learning outcomes.

5.1.3 Master's degree program **shall** be based on the implementation of original research, courses and other types of work that require analytical and critical thinking.

5.1.4 Medical educational organization **shall** ensure that the educational program is implemented in accordance with the principles of equality.

5.1.5 Medical educational organization **shall** ensure that a master's degree student fulfills obligations regarding doctors, teachers, patients and their relatives in accordance with the Code of Conduct/Code of Honor.

5.1.6 Master's degree program **shall** ensure that master's degree students are aware of the rules of ethics and responsible conduct of research.

5.1.7 Master's degree program **shall** be carried out under the supervision of

scientific guidance (standard “Scientific guidance”).

5.1.8 Medical educational organization **shall** determine the methods of teaching and learning.

5.1.9 Master’s degree program **shall** be structured with a clear time limit - equivalent to 1-2 years with a full-time job and contains:

- theoretical training, including study of cycles of basic and major disciplines;
- practical training of master's degree students - various types of practices, professional internships;
- research work, including the implementation of a master's thesis for scientific and pedagogical master's degree;
- experimental research work, including the implementation of the master's thesis for profession-oriented master's degree;
- interim and final certification.

5.1.10 Pedagogical practice (in accordance with the type of master’s degree) **shall** guarantee a master’s degree student the formation of practical skills and teaching methods

5.1.11 Research practice **shall** provide a master’s degree student with knowledge of the latest theoretical, methodological and technological achievements of domestic and foreign science, modern methods of research, processing and interpretation of experimental data.

5.1.12 Practical work of a master’s degree student **shall** provide a master’s degree student with the consolidation of theoretical knowledge gained in the learning process, the acquisition of practical skills, competencies and professional experience in the specialty being taught, as well as the development of advanced experience.

5.1.13 Medical educational organization **shall** develop an appeal mechanism that allows master’s degree students to review the decision regarding their programs and evaluate their theses.

## **5.2 Evaluation of master’s degree program**

5.2.1 Medical education educational organization **shall** have a program for monitoring processes and results, including routine collection of data on key aspects of the educational program. The purpose of monitoring is to ensure the quality of the educational process, identifying areas that require interventions.

5.2.2 Medical educational organization **shall** carry out a regular assessment of program quality, including feedback from supervisors and master’s degree students.

5.2.3 Medical educational organization **shall** systematically collect, analyze and provide teachers and master’s degree students with feedback that includes information about the process and products of the educational program, and also include information about unfair practices or inappropriate behavior of teachers or master’s degree students.

Medical educational organization **should** ensure that the process of updating and restructuring leads to:

5.2.4 adapting the curriculum model and methodological approaches in study process to ensure that they are relevant and appropriate;

5.2.5 adjustment of program elements and their interrelations in accordance with achievements in medical sciences, with changes in the demographic situation and the state of health/morbidity structure of the population and socio-economic, cultural conditions.



5.2.6 Medical educational organization **should** use feedback results to improve the educational program.

### **5.3 Stakeholder involvement**

5.3.1 Medical educational organization **shall** involve teaching staff and master's degree students, its administration and management in its monitoring program and activities to evaluate the educational program.

5.3.2 Medical educational organization **should** involve other stakeholders in the evaluation process, including representatives of academic and administrative staff, public members, authorized education and healthcare authorities, and professional organizations.

5.3.3 Medical educational organization **should** provide access to the evaluation results of the educational program.

5.3.4 Medical educational organization **should** ensure that the process of updating and restructuring leads to improvement in the process of monitoring and evaluating the program in accordance with changes in final learning outcomes and teaching/learning methods.

## **6. Standard "SCIENTIFIC GUIDANCE"**

6.1 Medical educational organization **shall** provide each master's degree student with a supervisor, and, as appropriate, a co-supervisor, to cover all aspects of the program.

6.2 Supervisor and a research topic of master's degree students **must** be approved based on the decision of the Academic Council and rector order of the medical educational organization.

6.3 The supervisor of a master's degree student **shall** have a degree and be actively involved in research in this area of science (in the specialty of education of a master's degree student).

6.4 Medical educational organization **shall** have clearly defined duties and responsibilities of supervisors.

6.5 Supervisors **shall** conduct regular consultations with their master's degree students.

6.6 Master's degree student **shall** be trained on the basis of an individual work plan, which is compiled under the guidance of a supervisor.

Medical educational organization **should** plan and organize training courses for supervisors on the policy of implementing the master's degree program, the main responsibilities of supervisors.

## **7. Standard "THESIS"**

7.1 The thesis topic and the supervisor of the master's degree student **shall** be approved after enrollment to the master's degree.

7.2 The thesis topic **shall** be assessed and approved by a group of independent experts (examiners) through external evaluation of a written description or based on the presentation of a research paper.

7.3 A master's degree program **shall** be completed with the preparation and submission of a thesis, which is an indicator of the formation of competencies of a master's degree student in accordance with the educational program.

7.4 Research work in scientific and pedagogical master's degree **shall**:

- correspond to the main problematics of the specialty in which the master's thesis is submitted;
- be relevant, contain scientific novelty and practical significance;
- based on modern theoretical, methodological and technological achievements of science and practice;
- be performed using modern research methods;
- contain research (methodical, practical) sections on the main submitting provisions;
- base on international best practices in the relevant field of knowledge.

7.5 Experimental research work in the field of master's degree **shall**:

- correspond to the main problematics of the specialty in which the master's thesis is submitted;
- based on modern achievements of science, technology and production, and contain specific practical recommendations, independent solutions of managerial tasks;
- be performed using advanced information technologies;
- contain experimental research (methodological, practical) sections on the main submitting provisions.

7.6 Medical educational organization **shall** determine the deadline for the preparation of the thesis, limited to 1-2 summer period(s).

7.7 The thesis **shall** be written by master's degree student independently, contain a set of scientific results and provisions put forward by the author for public submission.

7.8 The structure of the thesis should include a review of the literature relating to the research topic, goals and objectives of the research work, research methodology, results, discussion, conclusions and future research prospects.

7.9 The results of the thesis **shall** be made available to interested parties (master's degree students, supervisors, employees of the organization where the thesis has been carried out, researchers performing scientific work in a similar direction, and other categories of stakeholders), that is published if copyright or other reasons do not prevent this.

7.10 Thesis **shall** be accompanied by at least one publication and/or one presentation at a scientific and practical conference.

Medical educational organization **shall** provide a discussion of the thesis of the master's degree student at a meeting of the department (departments) where the thesis has been carried out.

## **8. Standard "THESIS EVALUATION"**

8.1 Medical educational organization **shall** determine, approve and publish the principles, methods and practices used to assess master's degree students, including the criteria for thesis evaluation.

8.2 The final assessment and approval of the thesis **shall** be carried out by the State Attestation Commission (SAC) for the submission of master's theses.

8.3 Thesis submission **shall** be carried out at the medical educational organization where this master's degree student is studying.

8.4 Thesis **shall** be reviewed.

8.5 Thesis submission **shall** include both the preparation of a written version and the subsequent oral submission.

8.6 Thesis submission **shall** be open to the public.

8.7 The academic master's degree **shall** be awarded by the medical educational organization on the basis of the decision of the State Attestation Committee, which assesses the thesis (the standard “Thesis”) and oral submission.

## **9. Standard “MANAGEMENT AND ADMINISTRATION”**

### **9.1 Program management**

9.1.1 The management of the medical educational organization **shall** be effective and ensure the improvement of the educational program.

9.1.2 Medical educational organization **shall** determine the structural unit responsible for educational programs and achievement of final learning outcomes.

9.1.3 The structural unit responsible for educational programs **shall** have the authority to plan and implement an educational program, including the allocation of provided resources for planning and implementing teaching and learning methods, evaluating master’s degree students, assessing an educational program and training courses.

9.1.4 Medical educational organization **shall** ensure the interaction of master’s degree students with the administration on the design, management and evaluation of master’s degree programs.

9.1.5 Medical educational organizations **should** encourage and facilitate the involvement of master’s degree students in the development of educational programs on preparation of master’s degree students.

9.1.6 The structural unit responsible for educational programs **shall** ensure the transparency of the management system and the decisions made, which are published in bulletins, posted on the website of the university, are included in the protocols for review and execution.

9.1.7 Medical educational organization **should**, through the structural unit responsible for educational programs, plan and implement innovations in the educational program.

9.1.8 Medical educational organization **should** include representatives from other relevant stakeholders in the deliberative body responsible for educational programs, including other participants in the educational process, representatives from clinical sites, graduates of medical educational organizations, health/pharmacy specialists involved in the training process or other university faculty teachers.

Medical educational organizations **should** ensure that the structural unit responsible for the educational program:

9.1.9 takes into account the particular conditions in which graduates have to work and modify the educational program accordingly.

9.1.10 considers the modification of an educational program based on feedback from the public and society as a whole.

9.1.11 Medical educational organization **shall** periodically conduct an assessment of academic management regarding the achievement of its mission and final learning outcomes.

9.1.12 Medical educational organization **should** ensure that the process of updating and restructuring leads to the improvement of the organizational structure and management principles of a master's degree program to ensure effective operation and (in the long run) to meet the interests of various groups of stakeholders in changing circumstances and needs.

## **9.2 Academic management**

9.2.1 Medical educational organization **shall** clearly define the responsibility of academic management in the development and administration of the educational program.

9.2.2 Medical educational organization **should** periodically evaluate academic management regarding the achievement of its mission and final learning outcomes.

## **9.3 Budget for training and resource allocation**

Medical educational organization **shall**:

9.3.1 have a clear set of responsibilities and authority for providing the educational program with resources, including a targeted budget for training;

9.3.2 allocate resources necessary for the implementation of the educational program, and distribute educational resources in accordance with their needs.

9.3.3 The system of financing a medical educational organization **shall** be based on the principles of efficiency, effectiveness, priority, transparency, responsibility, differentiation and independence of all levels of budgets.

9.3.4 Financial and administrative policy **shall** be aimed at improving the quality of the educational program.

Medical educational organization **should**:

9.3.5 provide sufficient autonomy in the allocation of resources, including decent remuneration of teachers in order to achieve final learning outcomes;

9.3.6 in view of the allocation of resources, take into account scientific achievements in medicine and the problems of public health and their needs.

## **9.4 Administration staff and management**

Medical educational organization **shall** have the appropriate administrative and academic staff, including their number and composition in accordance with the qualifications in order to:

9.4.1 ensure the implementation of the educational program and relevant types of activity;

9.4.2 guarantee proper management and allocation of resources.

9.4.3 Medical educational organization **should** develop and implement an internal program of quality assurance of management, including consideration of needs for improvement, and conduct regular management review and analysis.

9.4.4 Medical educational organization **shall** ensure the implementation of the master's degree program in accordance with the quality management system certified by independent organizations.

## **9.5 Interaction with the healthcare sector**

9.5.1 Medical educational organization **shall** have a constructive interaction with the

healthcare sector, with related sectors of healthcare, society and government, including the exchange of information, cooperation and initiatives of the organization, which contributes to the provision of qualified professionals in accordance with the needs of society.

9.5.2 Medical educational organization **shall** provide operational connection between the educational program and the subsequent stages of training.

9.5.3 Medical educational organization should be given an official status to cooperation with partners in the healthcare sector, which includes the conclusion of formal agreements with the definition of the content and forms of cooperation and/or concluding a joint contract and establishment of a coordinating committee, and joint activities.

## Bibliography

- [1] Law of the Kyrgyz Republic “On Education” dated April 30, 2003 No. 92 (as amended on January 16, 2015 No. 15)
- [2] The concept of development of education in the Kyrgyz Republic until 2020, approved by the Decree of the Government of the Kyrgyz Republic dated March 23, 2012 No. 201.
- [3] The strategy of education development in the Kyrgyz Republic for 2012–2020, approved by Decree of the Government of the Kyrgyz Republic dated March 23, 2012 No. 201.
- [4] Resolution of the Government of the Kyrgyz Republic of September 29, 2015 No. 670 “On approval of acts on independent accreditation in the education system of the Kyrgyz Republic”.
- [5] MacCarrick G. (2011) A practical guide to using the World Federation for Medical Education standards. *WFME 2: educational program. Ir. J Med Sci.* (2010) 179 (4):489–491. E-Pub 2010 Sep 17 (Received 10.10.2011 from Springer).
- [6] WFME Global Standards for Quality Improvement in Medical Education: European Specifications For Basic and Postgraduate Medical Education and Continuing Professional Development. WFME/AMSE International Task Force, WFME Office Copenhagen. See WFME and AMSE websites: [www.wfme.org](http://www.wfme.org) and [www.amse-med.eu](http://www.amse-med.eu).
- [7] WHO/WFME (2005) Guidelines for Accreditation of Basic Medical Education. Geneva/Copenhagen, 2005.
- [8] World Federation for Medical Education (2007) Global Standards for Quality Improvement in Medical Education. European Specifications For Basic and Postgraduate Medical Education and Continuing Professional Development. MEDINE Quality Assurance Task Force, WFME Office, University of Copenhagen, Denmark.
- [9] World Federation for Medical Education (2005) Promotion of Accreditation of Basic Medical Education A Program within the Framework of the WHO/WFME Strategic Partnership to Improve Medical Education. WFME Office, the Panum Institute Faculty of Health Sciences, University of Copenhagen, 2005.
- [10] World Federation for Medical Education (1998) International standards in medical education: assessment and accreditation of medical schools' - educational programs. A WFME position paper. The Executive Council, the World Federation for Medical Education. *Med Educ.* 1998 Sep.; 32(5):549-58.
- [11] Nerad M, Heggelund M (eds): *Toward a Global PhD*, Univ Washington Press 2008.
- [12] "Doctoral Programmes for the European Knowledge Society" Bologna Seminar, Salzburg, 3-5 February 2005. [www.eua.be](http://www.eua.be).
- [13] The Bologna Declaration of 19 June 1999; Joint declaration of the European Ministers of Education. <http://ec.europa.eu/education/policies/educ/bologna/bologna.pdf>.
- [14] Zagreb declaration and ORPHEUS consensus documents 2004-2011. [www.orpheus-med.org](http://www.orpheus-med.org).
- [15] ORPHEUS 2009 position paper: *Towards Standards for PhD Education in Biomedicine and Health Sciences*. 2009. [www.orpheus2009.org/](http://www.orpheus2009.org/) and ORPHEUS website: [www.orpheus-med.org](http://www.orpheus-med.org).

- [16] Salzburg II Recommendations: European universities' achievements since 2005 in implementing the Salzburg Principles. European Universities Association - Council for Doctoral Education. 2010. [www.eua.be/cde](http://www.eua.be/cde).
- [17] Colorado Department of Education. Public Library Technology Standards. Denver: Colorado Department of Education 2011. Available: <http://www.cde.state.co.us/cdelib/Standards/Index.htm>.
- [18] Decree of the Government of the Kyrgyz Republic “On Medical Postgraduate Education in the Kyrgyz Republic” dated July 31, 2007 No. 303.
- [20] “Strategy for the Development of postgraduate and continuing medical education in the Kyrgyz Republic for the period 2014-2020 years”, Order of the Ministry of Health of the Kyrgyz Republic No. 248 of 18.05.15.